

THE FRENCH OF OUTREMER

Communities and Communications in the Crusading Mediterranean

LAURA K. MORREALE AND NICHOLAS L. PAUL, EDITORS

Liber xv.



quel le moi
duner qh
soul rās
du reue
nul li es
por trouer
herbal ac
cheuals
per les ch;
ll emper
vel fist en

er par tout q̄ cel gens la pai
reiffaillent & fist charger les en
grent auant ceu q̄ ot enuoyes
ces messages au prince d'ami
oche. & au conre de robaul quil
alaissent enforciement auoec
lui en loit. Quant il ot toutes
cel gentz assamblees li fut lo
ner cel trompes & mur mlt no
blement q̄ me li grant liel q̄ il
estoit. Si greigoil qui louge
ment auoient le iourne en
pail & auoient ḡnt samblant
de cheualier a la guerre vo
lentiers. il la decierent tot droit
uers la cite de celare pe reur
les couuenances quil auoient au
prince. iceste citez nest mie iode
celare si licet enlurie. dont ie
vol au parle mantel foit delus
q̄ au vne autre q̄ est outre an

licet ou soumet dou tierce. Si estoit
si foit quele ne peust mie estre p̄
se se p̄ assamer ne fust. a deie
& a seueire cloient la vile desfor
murs qui descendoient de .ii. part
nul quel en laigrie courant. l'emper
tel fut ala gentz passer le fin q̄ il
ot ven tout le liege de la vile. & la ḡt
faic logier tout entour en cele par
tie ou il auoit vu loure enclot de
mur fist decier ces engiens diluec
debaillor les tourelles & la mur de
grosses pierres. les maisons m̄ al
mel de la vile abatoient en plusieurs
luis les pierres qui per desour les murs
volotent. des gentz meismes ifaillor
ou grand damngel par les mou
taignes. li empererel qui estoit
houn de ḡnt citez se traueillor en
mantel maneres de greuer cell de
deul armes aloit de haubiere lon
chapel de fer en la teste entour les
engiens. & louent estoit entour les
assalleors & de parole les amone
stort moue bien & donnoit ḡnt dōs
a cell qui bien le faisoient. ḡnt cuer
pendoient libacheler de son ost
de ceu q̄ veoient leur seigno: en
traus. il meismes chaugoit celo
qui estoient las. & faillor vent au
tres plus fires en leur luis. La mal
uaise grengor du prince & du

THE FRENCH OF OUTREMER

*Communities and Communications
in the Crusading Mediterranean*

LAURA K. MORREALE AND NICHOLAS L. PAUL

EDITORS

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY PRESS

New York 2018

71. I wish to thank Jakub Kujawiński for having drawn my attention to this latter form.

72. Nobel, "Écrire dans le Royaume franc: La scripta de deux manuscrits copiés à Acre au XIIIe siècle," in *Variations linguistiques: Koinè, dialectes, fr. régionaux*, ed. Pierre Nobel (Besançon: Presses universitaires de Franche-Comté, 2003), 33–52. The first two books have been edited by Nobel, *La Bible D'Acre: Genèse et Exode* (Besançon: Presses universitaires de Franche-Comté, 2006).

73. Hugo Buchtal, *Miniature Painting in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1957), 54–64. Further analysis has been provided by Folda, *Crusader Art*, 282–95.

74. Martin da Canal, *Les estoires de Venise*, trans. Laura Morreale (Padua: Unipress, 2009), xvii.

75. *Ibid.*, xii.

76. How slippery a concept "correctness" is has been shown, regarding the medieval French and Franco-Italian versions of Marco Polo's book, by Simon Gaunt, *Marco Polo's "Le Devisement du Monde": Narrative Voice, Language and Diversity* (Cambridge: Boydell and Brewer, 2013), 24–26.

77. It is fair to say that at the time of Limentani's edition the studies on the French of Outremer had still to be written. Eastern features in Martin's French have been gathered by Zinelli, "Sur les traces de l'atelier," 23ff., and Minervini, "Le français dans l'Orient latin," 152, 173.

78. Martin da Canal, *Les estoires de Venise*, cl–cliii.

79. For most of these features, see Minervini, "Le français dans l'Orient latin," 156–59, 173–75. A closer examination of the *scripta* of the manuscript is provided in Zinelli, "Il francese di Martino da Canal," in *Francofonie medievali*, ed. Anna Maria Babbi and Chiara Concina, Convegno Internazionale Verona, 11–13 settembre 2014, forthcoming.

80. Martin da Canal, *Les estoires de Venise*, lxxviii–lxxiv.

81. Moreover, the third scribe seems twice to be troubled by the word *ziaus* as probably proved by the aforementioned forms *zeus* (which is a hapax, maybe an error) and *siaus*, which finds itself on a line return for *a | siaus*, which could be taken either as *a[s] siaus* or as *as iaus*. Such a trouble might account for the fact that *ziaus* was a word of the model quite unfamiliar to him.

82. Limentani, "Martino da Canal e l'Oriente mediterraneo," in *Venezia e il Levante fino al secolo XV*, ed. Agostino Pertusi (Florence: Olschki, 1974), 2:229–52, and Minervini, "Le français dans l'Orient latin," 132.

83. Besides these models, a major reference was undoubtedly Geoffrey de Villehardouin's *La conquête de Constantinople*.

ROLES FOR WOMEN IN COLONIAL FANTASIES OF FOURTEENTH-CENTURY FRANCE: PIERRE DUBOIS AND PHILIPPE DE MÉZIÈRES

Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski

In the later Middle Ages crusading had become as much a cultural habit as actual military campaigns. Rather than donning clanking armor with emblems of crosses and departing into hot and unknown regions, many political leaders and thinkers preferred the sedentary pleasures of reading or writing about proposed crusades in treatises that often combined travel narratives with apparently concrete advice on launching a new crusade to recover the Holy Land. This "tenacious literary tradition served a range of religious and cultural functions" that often had little to do with the political realities of the areas the theorists purported to write about.¹ One of these cultural functions, I posit, was an unexpected one that was unique to one of these theorists—namely, the Norman lawyer Pierre Dubois (ca. 1250/55–after 1320): the valorization of women's roles in the recovery enterprise focused on education, medical practice, and the spreading of the Christian faith. Indeed, Dubois was the only one of the many theorists to pay attention to women, and he did so in radical and innovative ways.

Dubois hailed from Coutances in Normandy and became one of the most imaginative (if perhaps not the clearest) thinkers in the group of recovery theorists.² As did many other writers, he advocated and planned a recovery of the Holy Land, but he offered more precise ideas on actually colonizing the recovered territories, and these ideas involved women in unprecedented ways. I will explore the complex and important roles he laid out for them in his 1307 treatise *De recuperatione Terre Sancte* (The Recovery of the Holy Land), a text that included detailed proposals for the settlement and the creation of a state as well as for the education of the future colonizers.³ As a counterpoint I will offer a brief coda on Philippe de Mézières (1327–1405), an adviser to the French king Charles V, a diplomat and important author of political allegories and spiritual treatises. His

dreams and obsessions for many decades centered on the creation of a new chivalric order that would help to recover the Holy Land; in this context he offered proposals for women's roles in the new colonies he imagined for the Holy Land that differed radically from those of Dubois.

Unlike most other treatises in the recovery tradition, which focused almost exclusively on economic and military strategies for retaking the lost lands in the Levant, Dubois's text proposes a multipronged approach that, while it includes plans for military conquest, also deals with the creation and maintenance of a well-ordered society in the recovered territories as well as techniques for the infiltration and conversion of Muslim households; the latter task in particular he assigned to educated women. Dubois's plan envisages pan-European participation: he suggests that people from "every Catholic kingdom . . . should be permitted to occupy some city, fortress there, together with adjoining territory, the extent of such occupation being in proportion to the number of their own people taking part in the expedition." Further, European princes and magnates should supply warriors that will then remain in the Holy Land together with their wives so as "to populate the Holy Land and fill it with people in so far as they are needed for the conquest and maintenance of that land" (84; 128-29). The conquerors and new settlers should rename their cities and districts, choosing names that reflect the nomenclature of their countries of origin. In many detailed pages Dubois explains how a new secular legal system should be established that will be more efficient and less costly than the current European ones, where a lawsuit can exceed a person's lifespan (142-48; 171-76)! This complex plan, then, contains the elements necessary for a permanent settlement with new administrative and legal structures, elements that characterize a colony.

Transforming conquerors into settlers was not easy, however. Indeed, the question of how to keep crusaders in the Holy Land and establish a stable society had been a perpetual problem of the Frankish kingdoms. Thus one of Dubois's special concerns was what Antony Leopold termed the "terminal underpopulation" of the European kingdoms that had been created in the wake of the earlier crusades and that had come to an end with the Mamluk invasion of these territories, culminating in the fall of Acre in 1291.⁴ Dubois, whom one scholar labeled an efficiency expert *avant la lettre*,⁵ took an approach to the demographic deficiency of Westerners in the Levant that was in one respect completely original—that is, unlike the

other recovery thinkers, he refused to ignore an important demographic group that he dreamed would be involved in resettling the Holy Land: women. Consequently, his treatise assigns women some important functions in this project. Through the acquisition of medical skills and the learning of foreign languages in secular academies financed by a foundation, girls together with boys would be prepared for their new roles as colonists. Their education would take place in a completely new framework, independent from clerical schools and universities. While boys and girls would receive almost identical educations, women would be given the special task of infiltrating Muslim households in their roles as physicians and bringing about their conversion. Some of them should also marry the inhabitants, Muslims as well as Orthodox Christians, of the territories to be colonized.⁶ Thus, rather than displacing the indigenous population the new colonists would integrate them into the new Western Christian state, and women, both Christian and Muslim, would play crucial roles.⁷

Dubois's ideas on the function of women in colonial conquests in many ways prefigure those of some nineteenth- and twentieth-century colonial and postcolonial thinkers, such as Frantz Fanon, who in 1956 showed how the French colonizers of Algeria counted on the unveiling of Muslim women—which was couched in terms of liberation and modernization—in order to gain power over Muslim men.⁸ Similarly, Dubois believed that Muslim women, once converted by their Christian sisters, could become the gateway to the conversion and domination of their husbands. He thus believed that European women as colonizers could play an active role in the peaceful conversion of the indigenous population. He genders colonization differently than many other colonial thinkers: he does not see "colonial conquest as an erotics of ravishment" where the territory to be colonized is represented as a passive woman to be raped,⁹ but rather envisions complex roles for women both as colonizers and as the colonized. As physicians the Christian women would enter the private and intimate sphere of Muslim women; as potential wives they would enter that of Muslim and Orthodox men.¹⁰ The fear of interracial marriage and *métissage* that haunted so many colonial projects is absent here; indeed, for Dubois the subject of race never comes up.¹¹ Another intriguing link between Dubois and modern French colonial thought is the fact that it was in the heyday of French colonialism that Dubois was rediscovered (the first critical edition of Dubois's text by Charles-Victor Langlois appeared in 1891) and

that the author of the long essay on Pierre Dubois in the *Histoire littéraire de la France* of 1873 was Ernest Renan, whose strong advocacy of French colonialism as a civilizing mission is well known.¹²

Dubois is by no means an unknown thinker, but so far no scholar has considered where this ambitious layman may have found the inspiration for his unusual and daring ideas, particularly those centered on women and on the role of physicians in conversion activities. My analysis therefore places Dubois into both a medieval and a modern/critical framework and contextualizes his treatise's major innovations by presenting background on women's possible roles in converting Muslims and Orthodox Christians; on their acquisition of both theoretical and practical knowledge in medicine as well as of foreign languages; and on ideas of a secular education for girls. By briefly contrasting his model for colonization with that of the earlier Crusader States and with that of the later Philippe de Mézières, I propose that for Dubois, imagining the reconquest and the colonization of the Holy Land created a mental space to rethink and reshape received ideas on class and gender. An analysis of the function of women will allow us to see the important differences in the two men's concepts: for Dubois women become the crucial element for a colonization that marries violence with infiltration and conversion: converted Muslims would be part of the new state. For de Mézières, the presence of women in the new Christian states strengthens the separateness of the new settlers by keeping the men away from the dangerous indigenous infidel women.

PIERRE DUBOIS AND THE DREAMS OF A NEW CRUSADE

Starting in the early fourteenth century, galvanized by the conquest of Acre that spelled the end of a two-hundred-year Christian presence in Syria and Palestine, a number of crusade theorists began to imagine a concerted European effort at retaking the Holy Land.¹³ The crusades of the later Middle Ages on the whole did not correspond to the pan-European *passagium generale* envisioned by the many theorists of this time.¹⁴ These military campaigns were fragmented, not necessarily directed at the Holy Land, and for the most part unsuccessful. In this climate a strange mix of nostalgia for the "classic" international crusades of earlier centuries and innovative ideas on correcting past crusaders' mistakes flourished. The late medieval crusade theorists believed that the course of history could be reversed and

that new Outremer states could be created in which sometimes utopian visions could be realized. Fidenzio of Padua, William of Adam, Ramon Lull, and Marino Sanudo Torsello, to name just a few of these theorists active in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries, all, though with different emphases, treated the same themes: the strategic and military preparation of crusading armies; the raising of the necessary funds; the planning of routes on land or water; the most important targets (Egypt, Palestine, North Africa); the economic situation in the East and the positive repercussions a blockade of Mamluk Egypt would have; the unification of the chivalric orders to save money and increase their military power; the conquest of Constantinople as a precondition for a successful crusade; and the cooperation with the Mongols in order to stop the Muslim advance to the north.¹⁵ Lull, like Dubois, emphasized the importance of learning foreign languages and, also like Dubois, constantly recalibrated his preferences for peaceful missions versus military interventions, topics that we will return to later.¹⁶ But very few of these theorists gave any detailed advice on how to occupy the Holy Land once it had been taken.¹⁷ And although women had participated in the classic crusades in a variety of ways,¹⁸ women make no appearance in any of the treatises except Dubois's.

What unites these writers is a feeling of superiority and a can-do attitude: based on the recognition that earlier concepts for a permanent occupation of the Holy Land—namely, those that combined military force with missionary activities had failed—they all realized that new strategies were needed, strategies that took into account the demographic inferiority of the Christian conquerors and settlers and that offered new ways to secure their lasting presence and rule in the Holy Land. A number of the recovery theorists took aim at traditional concepts such as the roles of the papacy and the empire as well as the nature and function of the military orders. They subjected them to what Helmut G. Walther terms a "radikale Effizienzkratik" that could go so far as to call for a total transformation or even abolition of hitherto sacred institutions.¹⁹ But gender roles, the medieval class structure, and the nature of education were not generally questioned—except by Pierre Dubois.

Dubois studied with Thomas Aquinas and Siger of Brabant in Paris, became acquainted with Roger Bacon and Ramon Lull, and served most of his life as a royal advocate in his native district of Coutances. In 1302, a year marked by the growing conflict between the papacy and the French

monarchy, he composed a pamphlet (the only text he signed with his name) condemning Pope Boniface VIII as a heretic for his presumption of wanting to reign over the French king.²⁰ In this period he also began to "brood," as Walther Brandt puts it, over the conditions of the monarchy.²¹ In the group of recovery theorists Dubois stands out by orienting his ideas into somewhat different areas than the ones I listed previously: in his *De recuperatione Terre Sancte* he insisted on a pan-European peace movement as a necessary first step for a successful crusade and pondered the relationship of the French monarchy to the empire.²² He further proposed an international league of princes, a kind of League of Nations *avant la lettre*,²³ as well as a secularization of the possessions of the church coupled with a confiscation of the property of the military orders that should unite and reside in the Holy Land. These funds should then be used for a scheme of general education of all classes of society, including women.

De recuperatione Terre Sancte, which survives in a single manuscript in the Vatican Library (MS Reg. Lat. 1642), consists of two parts: the first begins with a preface addressed to the English king Edward I, at that point Duke of Aquitaine and therefore the French king's vassal, for whom Dubois acted as occasional counsel. These chapters (1–109) offer a detailed project for the retaking and the colonization of the Holy Land, while the second part (chapters 110–42) champions the French king Philip IV (r. 1285–1314) as the ruler of all of Europe, future emperor, and protector of the papacy, as well as the spiritual—if not practical—leader of a new crusade. The king, Dubois insists, should stay home and devote himself to what needs to be done in his own country, an idea that echoes contemporary criticisms of the crusade.²⁴ Recalling the earlier ideas of Charles d'Anjou, whose imperial ambitions had been crushed in the revolt of the Sicilian Vespers in 1282, Dubois proposed that the French king's brother Charles of Valois would eventually wear the imperial crown of Byzantium, a conquest that would then bring about the union of the Roman and Byzantine churches.²⁵ Dubois's grandiose insistence on the French leadership role distinguishes him somewhat from the other crusade theorists.

DUBOIS AND HIS IDEAS ON WOMEN IN MODERN SCHOLARSHIP

The two scholars who were particularly interested in Dubois in the later nineteenth century, Ernest Renan and Charles-Victor Langlois, summarized

Dubois's ideas on women without much comment.²⁶ It was the Dominican Bede Jarrett who in 1926 zeroed in on Dubois's ideas on women and went so far as to claim that Dubois believed in "the power latent in womanhood to influence and reconstruct society," while Walther Brandt, the translator of the *De recuperatione*, admitted that there were some original ideas in Dubois's treatise but not many. He concluded his 1930 essay with the following observation: "A thirteenth-century lawyer, representative of his age, he attempted to solve the problems of his day in much the same spirit in which similar problems of our day are met by the *men* of our own generation."²⁷

Thus Brandt, who knew Dubois's work better than most scholars, plays down one aspect that makes this provincial lawyer so interesting to us today—namely, his refusal to leave aside one half of the European population in his colonial scheme for the Holy Land: women. Otto Gerhard Oexle, in a thorough study of Dubois's place in the tradition of utopian thought, recognizes the innovative character of Dubois's proposals of educating women and sending them out into the Holy Land, but he does not explore where Dubois's inspiration for these ideas could have come from.²⁸ Indeed, none of the many scholars who have analyzed Dubois's treatise posed a question I consider crucial: how was it possible that this lawyer from Normandy could think new thoughts about women's roles in a period of entrenched ideas about women and their limited intellectual capacities? For, to repeat, no other crusade theorist before Philippe de Mézières several generations later had considered how women might contribute to a new colonial enterprise; and Philippe had in mind quite different roles for women in his colonizing schemes, as we will see. It is therefore worthwhile to explore Dubois's ideas in the context of his time. What kind of knowledge could a thinker like Pierre Dubois have had in order to create the ideas he laid out in his *De recuperatione Terre Sancte*, and how could he contextualize them? Unlike Philippe de Mézières and most of the theorists contemporary to Dubois, the lawyer from Normandy had never traveled to the Holy Land, so he relied on hearsay, on his knowledge of literature (including epics and romances) as well as of previous treatises on the theme of recovering the Holy Land, such as the many works by Lull, whom he had met in Paris. But he also had a creative mind that proposed some ideas and solutions that strike us as quite unusual for his time. More than did previous authors of recovery texts, he thought

about the aftermath of a crusade: the settling of the conquered territories, the kinds of citizens these settlements would require, and how to bring about the conversion of the indigenous populations.

DUBOIS'S IMAGINATIVE HORIZONS:
CONVERSION AND INTERMARRIAGE

Dubois's ideas on the reconquest and settlement of the Holy Land certainly fit into medieval colonial schemes;²⁹ realizing such schemes, however, was very problematic. Indeed, as Sally McKee points out, true colonization or "capturing, occupying, and governing distant territories . . . was beyond the abilities of most states in the Middle Ages."³⁰ Whether the Christian kingdoms in the Holy Land that existed in various forms from the First Crusade to the fall of Acre in 1291 were colonial societies is a question that has divided scholars for several generations. Learned opinions on the nature of these kingdoms run the gamut from the segregationist model championed especially by Joshua Prawer to the nuanced analysis of cohabitation offered by Ronnie Ellenblum and the "rough tolerance" posited more recently by Christopher MacEvitt.³¹ Interestingly, these models are roughly representative of de Mézières's and Dubois's concepts for a new settlement of the Holy Land: the former envisions closed-off immigrant communities with no discernible ties to the indigenous population; the latter imagines multiple connections between the two groups, produced by intermarriage and conversion.

Religious identities in the multicultural and multilingual societies of the eastern Mediterranean were far from fixed and allowed for a large variety of interaction.³² In the Levant, modes of coexistence ranged from violence to tolerance and even intermarriage and cohabitation.³³ The term "contact zone" used by Mary Louise Pratt in *Imperial Eyes* suggests itself. Pratt defines a contact zone as "an attempt to invoke the spatial and temporal copresence of subjects previously separated by geographical and historical disjunctures, and whose trajectories now intersect." In this model, the colonizers and colonized relate "in terms of copresence, interaction, and interlocking understandings and practices."³⁴ It is a paradigm of this kind that appeals to Dubois in his colonial fantasies. Women—educated women—are to infiltrate Muslim society by acting as physicians to Muslim women and by marrying infidel princes and converting them—

the latter idea would certainly have run into trouble with the marriage laws of the previous Outremer states³⁵ and would have caused the ire of other theorists such as Fidenzio of Padua, for whom this kind of "diversity" equaled impurity, in fact the very impurity that caused these states' downfall.³⁶

Let us look in turn at two of Dubois's major ideas: conversion and intermarriage.

According to Robert I. Burns, medieval missionaries intent on converting Muslims had five tactics at their disposal:

Secret conversions, via commercial, chaplain, or other contacts; fanatic confrontation, designed to precipitate a dramatic response; infiltration via metaphysical dialogue with whatever Islamic savants came to hand; diplomatic maneuvers toward winning a potentate, in whose footsteps many subjects could drift into Christianity; or finally, cracking the military carapace by conquest, to expose an Islamic region to public proselytism.³⁷

None of these methods, which Burns assigns to the new mendicant orders of the thirteenth century, involved women in any explicit way, although, as we will see, the converted "potentate" does surface as a literary theme in which women have an important function. To find women's roles in the conversion of Muslims, then, we have to enter the realm of the literary imagination where the copresence envisioned by Mary Louise Pratt is activated in a variety of ways.³⁸ Epics and romances, often presented orally at meals and other social occasions, were part of the life of male and female aristocrats as well as of learned men like Dubois;³⁹ they functioned as creators of imaginative horizons and value systems: their fictionality did not necessarily invalidate the ideas expressed by their characters.

Marriage and conversion of both male and female Muslims were popular themes in romance and epic texts, which could serve as an inspiration to thinkers like Dubois.⁴⁰ As Benjamin Z. Kedar puts it, "conversion of the Muslim enemy was an important component of the fantasy world of the western knight."⁴¹ As we saw earlier, Dubois imagined a two-pronged approach to conversion: Christian women would marry Muslim men and convert them, and then, in a kind of domino effect, more and more Muslims might become Christians; the other prong was represented by female physicians who would spread the Christian message (with a focus on the

blessings of monogamy) to Muslim ladies. In order to understand the imaginative horizon of writers in Dubois's time we have to make a brief excursion into the epic and romance literature dealing with the relationship between Muslims and Christians. These texts show that literature in the vernacular, whose audience included women, could offer different roles to female protagonists in interactions with Muslims than those we find in ecclesiastical and monastic sources.

Medieval epics and romances played out a number of different scenarios of Muslim conversion to the Christian faith. The late twelfth-century *Prise d'Orange*, for example, recounts Guillaume Fièrbrace's amorous conquest of the Muslim queen Orable, who, out of love, delivers the city of Orange to the Franks and is baptized. She thus becomes "an ideologically satisfying gendered representation of medieval colonialism."⁴² The mid-twelfth-century *Floire et Blancheflor*, an extremely popular pan-European romance, shows us another fantasy of conversion when the Muslim Floire converts out of love for Blancheflor and forces all his subjects to convert after his own baptism.⁴³ In the thirteenth-century epic *La chrétienté Corbaran*, written in a period when the demise of the Frankish states in the Levant was near, the conversion of Corbaran, ruler of an imaginary Muslim state, solves the problem of how to govern the colonial Christian state in the absence of sufficient numbers of immigrants: once baptized as a Christian, Corbaran converts the entire population and thus creates a Christian country. Now a zealous proselytizer, Corbaran proposes to the sultan of Persia to get baptized and marry off his daughter to a Christian knight. In this epic, baptism and matrimonial alliances serve a "program of universal Christianization."⁴⁴ Dubois's ideas echo this kind of scheme. For while other theorists like Lull and Sanudo Torsello also planned on converting Muslims, they did not envision the kind of infiltration and conversion from within that epic texts placed within the realm of the possible.

The fantasy of conversion presented in literary texts like *La chrétienté Corbaran* resolves the conflict between crusade and mission in a way that did not correspond to the reality as it was known to churchmen and military planners at the time.⁴⁵ Nor was the Islam of literary texts faithful to the actual tenets of Muslim religion. In fact, literary texts contributed to "a deformed vision of the Orient."⁴⁶ Muslims were generally depicted as polytheistic idol worshippers. That the most common names of these idols,

Muhammad, Apollo, and Tervagan, denoted a totally fantastic pagan pantheon was part and parcel of the ideological program followed by medieval authors and their audiences: in this kind of literature the Muslim was the evil "other," rooted in materialism and excessive sexuality.⁴⁷ Knowledge of actual Muslim practices and beliefs did to some degree circulate in medieval Europe, but it never truly became part of the Western *imaginaire*, as Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny has demonstrated.⁴⁸ Epic and romance heroes and heroines continued to encounter monstrous and idolatrous Muslim "pagans" even after merchants, returning crusaders, and informed travelers brought back reports that in no way corresponded to literary stereotypes. Even the famous crusader Jean de Joinville (1225–1317), companion and biographer of the French king Louis IX (Saint Louis), was often in the grip of received ideas about Muslims even as his account of them included many eyewitness testimonies and what could be called "anthropological disquisitions" on their mores and customs.⁴⁹ The conversion of Muslims thus inscribed itself into a variety of contexts, ranging from polemical texts endorsing preaching missions of the mendicant orders to fictional accounts of Saracen princesses and princes converted through love. The most famous of those was, of course, the Saracen Bramimonde, who, toward the end of the *Chanson de Roland* (c. 1100) converts to Christianity *par amour*, but the theme remained in vogue throughout the Middle Ages.⁵⁰ And often the role of conversion was assigned to women. From the late eleventh century through the fifteenth, medieval authors rang the changes on this motif.

DUBOIS'S SCHEMES

Let us now see in more detail how Pierre Dubois as an early fourteenth-century layman and jurist tackled the question of women's roles in converting both Muslim men and women, how they would prepare for this task, and what the purpose of these conversions was. As indicated previously, the Latin Kingdoms in the Holy Land had always suffered from a lack of Western Christian populations. This demographic problem needed to be solved. We saw already that Dubois advocated an international approach to this problem by urging that "every Catholic kingdom . . . should be permitted to occupy some city, fortress, or other position of importance there [i.e., in the Holy Land]. . . . The names of these districts should be changed" to

reflect place names familiar to the new colonists from their home countries. Because peace will have been established throughout Europe, there will be available large numbers of volunteer and self-financed warriors who together with their wives are urged to "populate the Holy Land and fill it with people in so far as they are needed for the conquest and maintenance of that land." Dubois is much concerned that the new settlers should feel at home so that they will in fact stay on in the new colonies; thus, in addition to the familiar place names Dubois promises them "physicians and surgeons" who would attend to them "with diligent care and comfort" (84; 128).⁵¹ This reference to the availability of medical care in the newly recovered territories distinguishes Dubois's text from the other recovery treatises, which offered strategies for reconquest but stopped short of offering ideas for the well-being of the new settlers. Interestingly, in this first reference to the medical personnel necessary for the European population no female physicians are mentioned; they appear later in the text in connection with Dubois's plans for conversion.

Dubois further proposes that large cities like Acre or Jerusalem would be divided up between immigrants from several different nations, including Spain. Would this plan be a replay of the early crusades, during which, according to one model, the Muslim inhabitants of cities "disappeared either through massacre, expulsion, or voluntary exile"?⁵² Dubois seems to be aware that violence would create permanent "enemies of peace" (141; 171) that would surround the Western immigrants. This fear seems to me the key to Dubois's ideas on conversion through infiltration and the female version of fraternization. He is afraid that the inferior population numbers of the Christians of Outremer would again lead to the isolation and possible extinction of the Christian settlers. Philippe de Mézières, as we will see, hoped to solve this problem by the mass immigration of entire families. And while Dubois advocated family settlements in the Holy Land as well, he also saw conversion as a means to "create" an indigenous Christian population that would turn foe into friend and thus facilitate the permanent occupation of the region.⁵³ Key elements in this plan were educated women, trained in schools of Dubois's design. Dubois envisioned their conversionary roles as follows:

While others are pursuing a policy of inflicting injury on the Saracens, making war upon them, seizing their lands, and plundering their other

property, perhaps girls trained in the proposed schools may be given as wives to Saracen chiefs, although preserving their faith lest they participate in their husbands' idolatry. By their efforts, with the help of God and the preaching disciples so they may have assistance from Catholics—for they cannot rely on the Saracens—their husbands might be persuaded and led to the Catholic faith. Little by little our faith might be made known among them. Their wives would strive more zealously for this because each of them has many wives. (124; 158–59)

Like Fanon in the twentieth century, Dubois thus believed that women were the means to access and dominate men in a colonial context. While for the modern thinker the veil was the symbol whose removal would liberate women and incite them to make their men accept colonial rule as a benefit, for Dubois Muslim polygamy and the disgust he was certain Muslim women felt for it was to provide the impetus for conversion and the acceptance of European colonial rule. Indeed, in a fourteenth-century epic, *Florent et Octavien*, a young Muslim woman judges her own religion worthless by comparison with Christianity precisely because of the polygamy permitted by Islam. She laments that "a sultan or a king can have ten wives . . . and women are not any more prized than sheep. But if a Christian man takes a wife there will be only one bed for them for the rest of their lives."⁵⁴ She certainly sees this exclusivity as desirable and as an incentive for conversion.

Dubois elaborates on these ideas in his more detailed prescriptions for the young women's preparation for these roles:

Girls should be instructed in medicine and surgery, and the subjects necessary for this. With such training and knowledge of writing, these girls—namely, those of noble birth and others of exceptional skill who are attractive in face and figure—will be adopted (*adoptabuntur*) as daughters and granddaughters by the greater princes of their own countries, of the Holy Land, and of other lands adjacent thereto. They will be so adorned at the expense of the said foundation that they will be taken (*credantur*) for daughters of princes, and they may be conveniently married off to the greater princes, clergy, and other wealthy easterners. They must promise that when married to leading men or to those of other rank they will, during their lifetime if possible, repay to the said foundation the sum expended to them. . . . It would be an excellent thing

for the eastern prelates and clergy to have such wives; it is their custom to marry, and they have been unwilling to follow the Roman and other western clergy in renouncing the privilege of marriage. (118-19; 154)

Dubois posits that these wives would "teach their children and husbands" by arguments, not by feminine wiles, to "adhere to the Roman faith." They would draw "the inhabitants of these districts to the Roman faith." Their skill in medicine and surgery, moreover, would grant them access to Muslim women in need of conversion who would so love their physicians that they would "unite with them in the articles of faith and the sacraments" (119-20; 155) once they realized that monogamy was much preferable to polygamy.

These passages, though often cited in passing,⁵⁵ deserve another look. A close reading reveals a whole nexus of a rethinking of class and gender roles and of the nature of religious conversion in the context of colonization. In the first passage (124; 158-59) Dubois's multipronged approach to the recovery of the Holy Land is evident: military conquest is as much a part of it as conversion, adoption, and marriage. Like Ramon Lull, Dubois seems all-inclusive in his plans for crusades and missionary activities, seeing no contradiction between them.⁵⁶ But unlike his predecessors, including Lull, Dubois sees the arrival of educated colonizers as a key element for a successful permanent occupation of the Holy Land.

Dubois's vision of girls of noble origin or simply skilled (that is, not necessarily from the aristocracy but in any case, attractive) being educated and "adorned" by the foundation so that they will be adopted by a variety of Western and Eastern princes and other wealthy "Easterners," who will then (presumably) marry them off, is quite perplexing. In conjunction with the passage found on page 124 of Brandt's translation, cited previously, it is clear that both Muslims and Eastern clergy are the targets of this marriage scheme, which is linked to conversion. This particular vision of adoption and infiltration through marriage, followed by conversion, has, as far as I can ascertain, no parallels in other sources.⁵⁷ Dubois sees a society where social and religious identities are not fixed for eternity, where there exists the possibility of social ascent and agency for girls; and where both of these are predicated on education.

WOMEN'S EDUCATION: MEDICINE AND FOREIGN LANGUAGES

The two fields in which Dubois's ideas on women's education are most striking are medical training and the acquisition of foreign languages; neither of these fields was open to women in the medieval educational system. Yet, a number of scholars play down the audacity of Dubois's ideas on women's education.⁵⁸ Jacques Verger, for example, insists that one should see Dubois's ideas *only* in relation to his crusading ideology. Certainly, Dubois's educational program would not produce independent and critically minded citizens. Rita Copeland rightly argues that "Pierre Dubois's pedagogical regime, where the literal sense defines the limits of what young pupils need to know," is a "defence against exploration of deeper meaning." "Classrooms," Copeland insists, "are always inscribed in greater structures of political power."⁵⁹

I would see Dubois's plans as somewhat more radical: Dubois's ideas for a foundation financing secular educational institutions for girls and boys of all classes certainly had no precedent.⁶⁰ Pierre Dubois devised his ideas on education in a resolutely secular context, and although he saw women's knowledge of foreign languages and of medicine principally as means of conversion, the schools in which they were to acquire these skills would be supported by a nonreligious foundation. They would in fact be public schools, open to all classes of society.

Public schools, as we think of them today, did not exist in the Middle Ages. Boys could gain an education in cathedral schools, monasteries, or through tutors if they were noble or wealthy enough, and then go on to university. Girls of the upper classes could be educated at home or in a convent but had no access to higher education. There seems to be some evidence of the existence of lay schools as early as the ninth century and of some schools for boys and girls associated with Notre Dame in Paris in the late fourteenth century, but the evidence remains sketchy.⁶¹ In any case, these kinds of institutions were rare and most likely remained informal, not part of a wider system of schooling.

The universities that were formed from loose associations of scholars and teachers in the course of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries did not welcome women. While women were not officially banned from universities, the clerical environment of the universities excluded women by definition: they could not be clerics, and therefore they could not participate in any

kind of university training. As Bea Lundt argues in her essay on the medieval university as a "man's world," no official interdiction was necessary to keep women out. Women's absence from universities was taken for granted and did not need to be "justified or debated," as Ruth Mazo Karras points out. The medieval university established "a model of gender-differentiated education that persisted into the twentieth century."⁶² To this day there is a serious deficit of women in the sciences, and this situation—which is not natural but "constructed"—is a legacy of the clerical character of the medieval university, which, as David F. Noble so aptly put it, was "a world without women."⁶³

In contrast to the universities, where a course of study in theology or law could last twelve to fifteen years, Dubois gave much thought to "time to degree"—that is, streamlining and shortening the course of study. In the spirit of efficiency he would not tolerate "eternal students!"⁶⁴ Dubois's system was designed to produce, as quickly and as efficiently as possible, a population qualified to occupy and administer the Holy Land. The schools would be financed through a foundation funded through the secularization of clerical property and that of the military orders.⁶⁵ Nunneries should be abolished and transformed into educational academies for girls. An equal number of schools for boys and girls should be created. First noble and then non-noble talented children would be chosen for these academies by a "wise philosopher." Only if parents are able to refund the tuition costs at some future point would they ever see their children again. Arrangements for sending these educated people to the Holy Land, or possibly "other countries" (*alias regiones*), would be made by the foundation's director (117; 153). Both girls and boys should study Latin and Greek as well as Arabic and other Eastern languages that will be useful for converting non-Catholics. Grammar, logic, and "rapid" instruction in the articles of the faith and basic religious tenets follow.

Some of the more advanced topics seem destined for boys only, and Dubois first takes the traditional route on women's medical skills when he states in the context of boys' medical education, "These physicians and surgeons should have wives similarly trained, with whose help they can be of greater service to the ill" (131; 162–63). But what makes Dubois's ideas different from prevailing practice is that these women will be actually "trained" and not just learn from their husbands by apprenticeship. In a departure from traditional ideas on women's education, in his scheme, girls

will be formally educated in medicine and surgery, but they will acquire these skills at the academies Dubois envisions, not at universities.

Women physicians and surgeons were active in medieval society, but their education differed from those of men, something Dubois wanted to remedy. Female surgeons, for example, were allowed to practice mostly as successors of their late surgeon husbands.⁶⁶ Women provided healthcare in a variety of roles, not only in their homelands, but also on the crusades.⁶⁷ Dubois specifies that

All the girls of the foundation, like the males, should be instructed in Latin grammar and afterwards in logic and in one foreign language; then in the fundamentals of the natural sciences, and finally in surgery and medicine. [Those that are talented] will be instructed only in those parts of each science which have a bearing on medicine and surgery, and in a manner as far as possible more understandable, easier, owing to the weakness of their sex. (139; 169)

Women, according to Dubois, mature more quickly but may nonetheless be weaker. Some medical explanations of women's supposed weakness were based on their cold and dry nature, which made them more brittle; others on the matter that Eve was created from—that is, flesh and marrow, substances softer and weaker than Adam's body made from hardened clay.⁶⁸ In all these supposedly scientific explanations, "'nature' is the justification of how culture constructs women."⁶⁹ Thus medical explanations were used to reinforce cultural stereotypes. Here again Dubois surprises us: for him the physical weakness of some of his academy's girls does not influence their intellect. Although some of the girls may be "too delicate" to go overseas, they can still be teachers:

With their help the others . . . will be instructed more fully in both the theoretical and practical knowledge of surgery and medicine [*tam in theorica tam in practica*] and in those matters known to be related to the art and handicraft of apothecaries (139; 169).

While apothecaries and surgeons could learn their trade by apprenticeship, the "theory and practice" of medicine was the domain of the university.⁷⁰ Practice in this context cannot be divorced from theory, as the many medical treatises contemporary with Dubois's text show. Medical *consilia*, essentially collections of case histories, became a popular genre in the late

thirteenth century as more and more medical programs at universities began to require a practical internship.⁷¹ But this kind of practice could not be divorced from scientific university learning. Thus Dubois's insistence on wedding theory and practice in at least one domain of the medical profession expresses his confidence in women's ability to master a discipline that was out of reach for them in the medieval university.

Remarkably, the other crusade theorists did not include medical personnel in their schemes, at least not explicitly. Dubois's plans for his medical corps, in particular for its female members, go beyond the needs of the new crusaders, however; they are linked to his ideas for a permanent colonization of the Holy Land. For not only will women's medical skills allow them to infiltrate the female Muslim population of the Holy Land and convert them to the Catholic faith (and its concomitant monogamy), but they will also make them more attractive to men who might want to adopt them in their own countries, the Holy Land, and other regions. From there they may then be married off to yet other men, including Eastern clergy, as we saw in the passages quoted previously (118 and 138; 154 and 168-69). Cutting through this rather confusing wish list, one can see that the precondition for all these future functions is an education in medicine and surgery.

Why would this type of education allow them to establish close relations with indigenous women of a different faith? As Monica H. Green observes, "Medicine in general was an area where there was a considerable amount of cross-confessional interaction."⁷² A Jewish midwife practiced in Marseille, for example, while Muslim midwives could be found in Narbonne.⁷³ Based on the evidence in several essays in this volume on "Conversing with the Minority," it becomes apparent that in the area of midwifery a nexus of medical knowledge, gender relations, and conversion existed. Dubois, in a move that sets him apart, extended the possibilities for this kind of interactions to female physicians and surgeons. But he never specifies what type of medicine these women should practice. One could have expected a specialization in "women's medicine" of the type described in the *Trotula* tradition,⁷⁴ but Dubois does not seem to have a detailed knowledge of medieval medicine and remains vague on specifics.

In the realm of foreign languages Dubois gives some more detailed information, perhaps because of his acquaintance with that greatest champion of medieval education in foreign languages, Ramon Lull (c. 1232-1316), who spent his long life composing over 240 works, many of which dealt

with Christian-Muslim relations and the importance of the acquisition of languages, especially Arabic, useful for converting Muslims. Lull himself had learned Arabic on his home island of Mallorca. He believed that learned disputations in the Muslims' own language would be the most efficient missionary tool and therefore agitated for decades for the establishment of faculties for the study of foreign languages. Finally, in 1312, when Lull was already eighty years old, the Council of Vienne promulgated Canon 11, which called for the creation of two faculties for the study of Oriental languages at five different universities.⁷⁵ Already in the mid-thirteenth century, study of Arabic and other Oriental languages was encouraged by the papacy and implemented in cities like Paris and Seville.⁷⁶ In 1276 Lull had succeeded in persuading King James I of Mallorca to finance a foundation in which thirteen Franciscans would learn Arabic. He also envisioned the use of a universal language (not Esperanto, but Latin). In this project certain cities would be designated as Latin-only zones in which both men and women would be required to speak only Latin and then return to their homes and transmit this knowledge to their children, thus eventually creating a new generation of people who could communicate in this universal language. Lull thus took for granted that women could learn and propagate Latin.

Berthold Altaner rightly links Lull's ideas in this domain to those of Pierre Dubois but denies any direct influence because Dubois develops his project for foreign languages only in the context of a "systematic colonization" of the Levant.⁷⁷ Yet, it seems plausible that Dubois may have shared Lull's enthusiasm when he knew him in Paris, although unlike Lull he certainly did not know Arabic and had never traveled outside of France. The Norman lawyer proposes that children of both sexes should learn Latin and then "some of them should be given more thorough training in the Greek language, others in Arabic" so that they can assist the Roman Church and the Catholic princes in drawing Muslims and Orthodox Christians to the "Catholic faith and into unity with its head" (118; 153). Conversion and unification of the church are thus the aims of this multilingual corps of young people. The crucial point in the context of this study is that Dubois stipulates an equal access to the study and mastery of foreign languages for both boys and girls.

Dubois viewed women and their intellectual capacities in a different light than his contemporaries. He was a layman of the middle class whose

thought was not anchored in the misogynistic tradition that saw women as inferior intellects. Nor was he solely focused on the clergy or the aristocracy as a source for the highly learned segments of society. Together with his utopian vision of resettling the Holy Land, these characteristics enabled Dubois to think new thoughts: he was the first to articulate a comprehensive program for women's education that treated girls as boys' equals.⁷⁸ As for his colonialist plans, they provide the framework for his entire treatise, and almost all his ideas are linked to the recovery project. What is important is that he used this project "to think with" and that this thought swept away a number of traditional stereotypes of class and gender. And it is possible that his "girl teachers" were destined not only for the Holy Land: in the passage where he envisions girls as teachers of other girls, he suggests that "other lands" may be chosen for them, as well (117; 153). Thus his corps of educated women could enlarge their sphere of influence and perhaps make the idea of a universal education for women less utopian. But in the end, the fact that Dubois's ideas did not become reality but remained part of a colonial dream world is hardly surprising, given the realities of early fourteenth-century Europe.

PHILIPPE DE MÉZIÈRES'S COLONIAL DREAMS

By the time Philippe de Mézières envisioned his own colony in the Holy Land, conditions for a realization of this dream were even less propitious.⁷⁹ The Mamluks still occupied the Holy Land, and the Ottoman Turks' power grew and expanded rapidly. A new chivalric order seemed to offer a solution to Philippe. As a young pilgrim in the Holy Land Philippe had had a vision of Christ ordering him to found this new chivalric order, *l'Ordre de la chevalerie de la Passion de Jésus-Christ*, whose task it would be to retake the Holy Land and to found a new permanent Christian state there. The text for the order exists in three different versions, spanning the years 1367 to 1396, years that also mark the beginning and end of his literary activity.⁸⁰ This last date, 1396, was the year of the devastating defeat of European forces at the hands of the Turks at Nicopolis, a defeat that spelled the end of Philippe's dreams. As chancellor of Cyprus (ca. 1360–69) under Peter I de Lusignan, Philippe had worked tirelessly for a new crusade.⁸¹ After Peter's assassination Philippe returned to France, where he became tutor to the dauphin, the future Charles VI; then, after Charles V's death in 1380,

Philippe retired to the convent of the Celestins in Paris and began his prolific writing career. His best known work is *Le songe du vieux pelerin* (The Dream of the Old Pilgrim) of 1386–89, a vast political allegory designed as a mirror of princes for the young dauphin. Throughout his career Philippe reworked the text of the *Ordre de la Passion*, developing complicated schemes not only for retaking the Holy Land but also for the organization of the society once the new colony had been established.⁸² In these plans women play a considerable role.

In his *Songe du vieux pelerin* Philippe dreamed of a new crusade to be led by Charles VI and to be preceded by moral reform and internal peace in Europe. What is remarkable in his plan is that he strongly recommends that the crusaders should be accompanied by their wives in order to prevent the men from falling into sinful lasciviousness. Women, Philippe observes, are generally more pious than men and can be valiant, as one can see when studying the ladies who served all classes of crusaders in the past. In his new crusade, the ladies must be humble and prudent, dress modestly and according to their social status, and limit the size of their wardrobe and their entourage.⁸³ Modesty, humility, and prudence are, of course, the most traditional feminine virtues, and Philippe cannot envisage any other role for a woman in a secular context than that of wife; his crusading women always form half of a couple. Thus, when it comes to women, Philippe de Mézières was a much more conservative thinker than Pierre Dubois; indeed, his ideas on women in the new territories evoke the ideology of the nineteenth-century colonies in which "women found their activities and the social space in which they could operate tightly controlled."⁸⁴

Philippe de Mézières thought about women, marriage, and sexuality more extensively than Dubois. In 1386 Philippe wrote a long, extremely involved allegorical treatise, *Le livre de la vertu du sacrement de mariage* (The Book of the Virtue of the Sacrament of Marriage), meant as a guide for women seeking solace from unhappy marriages. While championing spiritual marriage, Philippe, a layman who had never been married himself, was nevertheless aware of humans' sexual urges, and, in the context of the crusade, he addressed this question not only in the *Songe du vieux pelerin* but also in the various versions of his rule for the *Ordre de la Passion*. Since his order was modeled on the military orders where members took vows of obedience and chastity, Philippe needed to give some thought to the problem of how men could remain chaste, especially in the hot climate

of their future settlements. To Philippe this task seemed difficult and even impossible, since the Orient's heat "stimulates the flesh."⁸⁵ The solution he proposed was marriage to women who would take vows like the men and would devote themselves to the future colonizers. This feature distinguishes Philippe's order from the previous military orders. Thus, while the recruitment for the order was rather diversified and potentially open to sons of bourgeois and artisans,⁸⁶ its rules for women were very restrictive and regimented. No girl surgeons or class-abolishing adoptions for Philippe. The women to be sent to the new colonies were to be wives, not budding professionals.

Philippe planned to be most explicit in regard to women's roles in his order in the Latin redactions of his *Nova religio*, but only the rubrics survive. They tell us about Philippe's prescriptions for women's dresses and cloaks and his complicated design of hairstyles involving multiple tresses wound together. Philippe specifies the color, size, and materials of the women's veils and even of the ribbons for their hair.⁸⁷ Fashion, as it does today, can be expressive of social class. Philippe subscribes to a rigid class structure within his utopian state. For, even though property will be held in common and the order is rather inclusive, movement between classes is not envisioned.⁸⁸ Thus, the wives of the lower members of the order will have somewhat less lavish outfits, shorter, and with fewer adornments. Pregnancy, childbirth, and breastfeeding are among other topics related to women. Philippe is unusual here in his call for women to breastfeed their own babies, rather than using wet nurses, and for widows to remarry as often as necessary.⁸⁹ Philippe thus champions a system of masculine control that reaches into the most intimate aspects of women's lives.

In order for women to fulfill their functions in Philippe's order no particular education was necessary, and indeed, when Philippe speaks of education he means boys. Philippe envisions schools for art and music, liberal arts, canon and civil law, and the holy scriptures, and like Dubois he sees the knowledge of foreign languages as a key element for the success of the new colonies. Philippe wants boys to learn seven or eight languages, including Chaldean, Arabic, Greek, and Armenian. In his diplomatic life Philippe had seen how important the knowledge of Arabic was: when writing about the crusades of Louis IX, he faults the king's advisers with not urging him to employ multilingual experts. Instead, he laments, the princes

surrounding Louis pridefully and wrongly accused those knowing Arabic to be "half Arabic" themselves and therefore untrustworthy!⁹⁰ That he recounts this anecdote twice, both in his rule for the order and in the *Epistre lamentable et consolatoire* (The Lamenting and Consoling Epistle), written in early 1397 in the wake of the defeat at Nicopolis, shows his indignation at the ignorance and misplaced pride of Louis IX's followers. But while Philippe shows great insight into the usefulness and necessity of knowing foreign languages, the idea that women could learn them as well does not occur to him. He seems to envision them sequestered in their new colonial communities and therefore not in need of any means to communicate with the surrounding peoples.

On the whole, women's lives in Philippe's new state are restricted and controlled by their husbands. Joan Williamson goes so far as to suggest that "by the imposition of stringent rules on the covering of the body when in public, silence and seclusion, these Western women whose husbands adhere to Philippe's Order are asked to live very much the restricted lives of Oriental women."⁹¹ But while these women may come to resemble the women of their new homeland, Philippe, as we just saw, envisages no connection between the indigenous population and the colonizers. Of course, he calls for the conversion of the peoples of the Orient but without giving any concrete advice on how to achieve this goal. He certainly would not tolerate the interfaith marriages Dubois imagines as a means of conversion but rather warns the future members of his order away from Near Eastern women: "se garde diligamment des femmes des mescreans et des scismatiques, comme de venin toute la Chevalerie entachant" (stay away diligently from women of the miscreants and schismatics as from poison that would stain the entire Order of Chivalry).⁹² The Christian wives that Philippe sees as an essential component of his new crusader order would function as shields against their husbands' possible corruption by these dangerous women. Philippe's depiction of Muslim (and Orthodox) women as "poison" conforms to the idea that "sexuality is the most salient marker of Otherness" and is thus dramatically different from Dubois's views of Muslim women as thinking beings who could be converted by their Christian female physicians.⁹³ Dubois believes that they would be able to understand not only the superiority of the Christian faith but also the preferability of monogamy over polygamy. In other words, he is convinced that women

can make up their own minds and make their own decisions. (Whether they would be allowed to do so is, of course, another question.) In any case, in all the literary works showing us Muslim princes and princesses converting to Christianity we have no example, I believe, of a professional woman being sent into the harem to "liberate" her Muslim sisters.

CONCLUSION

Both Pierre Dubois and Philippe de Mézières consider women an essential element of their new colonial Christian states, but they differ widely in the conceptualization of their roles. In Dubois's expansive and inclusive conception of a new colony, women's ability to be educated, to travel, and to become skillful ambassadors of the Christian faith in a variety of settings is not questioned. Whether as adopted daughters of princes, wives of Muslim men, or as physicians and surgeons, they can be trusted to find the ways and means of infiltrating Muslim society and work at its conversion. They would presumably also be part of the new colonial states as wives of Christian immigrants, but Dubois offers no details on how he imagines their functions in that context. For Philippe, on the other hand, in his segregationist colonial model, the matrimonial and maternal roles of women are the only ones that form part of his colonial fantasies. Women are supposed to serve their men in every respect and keep them from fraternizing with the indigenous population. He aims to control every last aspect of women's lives, from breastfeeding to the color of their hair ribbons.

None of Philippe's dreams ever materialized; not the crusade, not the new state, not the masses of modestly coiffed women trudging after their husbands to the Holy Land. And none of Dubois's schemes were ever realized, either. His girl surgeons and enterprising adoptees in the end remained confined to his imagination. Nonetheless, we moderns should appreciate Dubois and de Mézières's visions, which included that part of the European population that was left on the sidelines, not only in all of the other crusading schemes, but also in the realms of learning and politics. But unlike de Mézières, Dubois gave a voice, however limited, to the masses of women looking for a purpose that went beyond being wives and mothers, who craved an education and new roles in society but whose voices would not be heard for a long, long time.

NOTES

1. Christopher Tyerman, "New Wine in Old Skins? Crusade Literature and Crusading in the Eastern Mediterranean in the Later Middle Ages," in *Byzantines, Latins, and Turks in the Eastern Mediterranean World after 1150*, ed. Jonathan Harris, Catherine Holmes, and Eugenia Russell, Oxford Studies in Byzantium (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 287.
2. On the treatises advocating the recuperation of the Holy Land, see Sylvia Schein, *Fideles crucis: The Papacy, the West and the Recovery of the Holy Land 1274-1314* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991); Antony Leopold, *How to Recover the Holy Land: The Crusade Proposals of the Late Thirteenth and Early Fourteenth Centuries* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001); and Jacques Paviot, *Les projets de croisade (v. 1290 v. 1330)* (Paris: Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, 2008).
3. The most recent edition is Pierre Dubois, *De recuperatione Terre Sancte: Dalla "Respublica Christiana" ai primi nazionalismi e alla politica antimediterranea*, ed. Angelo Diotti (Florence: Leo S. Olschki, 1977). For a translation, see Dubois, *The Recovery of the Holy Land*, trans., with an introduction and notes by Walther I. Brandt, Records of Civilization, Sources and Studies (New York: Columbia University Press, 1956). Quotations from the text will be given parenthetically, first for the Brandt translation, then for the Diotti edition. On the ideas of state building in this context, see Sylvia Schein, "The Future Regnum Hierusalem: A Chapter in Medieval State Planning," *Journal of Medieval History* 10 (1984): 95-105.
4. Leopold, *How to Recover the Holy Land*, 188. On the history and nature of the Frankish kingdoms, see Joshua Prawer, *The Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem: European Colonialism in the Middle Ages* (London: Littlehampton, 1972). A reconsideration of this issue and a sustained critique of Prawer are in Ronnie Ellenblum, *Crusader Castles and Modern Histories* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
5. See Hans-Joachim Schmidt, "Bildungsreform als Kriegsvorbereitung: Die Vorschläge von Pierre Dubois zur Wiedergewinnung des Heiligen Landes," in *Personen der Geschichte—Geschichte der Personen: Studien zu Kreuzzugs-, Sozial- und Bildungsgeschichte; Festschrift für Rainer Christoph Schwingers zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. Christian Hesse, Beat Immenhauser, Oliver Landolt, and Barbara Studer (Basel: Schwabe Verlag, 2003), 431.
6. Both groups resided in the Levant and were targets of conversion; see Christopher MacEvitt, *The Crusades and the Christian World of the East: Rough Tolerance* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008).
7. That women can be seen as "indices of entire cultures" has been shown by Roxanne Euben, in *Journeys to the Other Shore: Muslim and Western Travelers in Search of Knowledge* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006), 190, and for the medieval Asian context by Kim M. Phillips, in *Before Orientalism: Asian Peoples and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014), chap. 5.

8. Frantz Fanon, "L'Algérie se dévoile," in *L'an V de la révolution algérienne* (Paris: La Découverte, 2001), 21–52 ("Dans le programme colonialiste, c'est à la femme que revient la mission de bousculer l'homme algérien," 25). For the many divergent readings of Fanon's piece, see Azzedine Haddour, "Torture Unveiled: Rereading Fanon and Bourdieu in the Context of May 1958," *Theory, Culture, and Society* 27 (2010), <http://tcs.sagepub.com/content/27/7-8/66>; consulted 12 April 2013.
9. Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 364. McClintock also refers to Edward Said's well-known observations on a "feminized Orient" where "sexuality is a trope for power relations" (14).
10. See Ann Stoler, "Genealogies of the Intimate: Moments in Colonial Studies," chap. 1, in her *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).
11. On interracial marriage, see Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge*, 39 and *infra*. On the existence and nature of medieval racism, see *The Origins of Racism in the West*, ed. Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009). For the fear of *métissage* in the French colonialist ideology indebted to the Middle Ages, see Zrinka Stahuljak, *Pornographic Ideology: Medicine, Medievalism, and the Invention of the French Nation* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), 83–85.
12. See Ernest Renan, "Pierre Du Bois, légiste," *Histoire Littéraire de la France* 26 (1873): 471–536, and Dubois, *De recuperatione Terre Sancte*, ed. Charles-Victor Langlois (Paris: Alphonse Picard, 1891). Michelle Warren has shown how French nineteenth-century philology and colonial thinking were bound together; see Warren, *Creole Medievalism: Colonial France and Joseph Bédier's Middle Ages* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010). For Renan's take on Dubois, see Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski, "Pierre Dubois (ca. 1250–1320) et Ernest Renan (1823–1892) en communauté de pensée? Quelques réflexions sur la colonisation et l'éducation des femmes," *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 4 (2015): 1531–48.
13. See Robert Irwin, *The Middle East in the Middle Ages: The Early Mamluk Sultanate, 1250–1382* (London: Croom Helm, 1986), chap. 4.
14. See Aziz Suryal Atiya, *The Crusade in the Later Middle Ages* (London: Methuen, 1938); Kenneth M. Setton, *The Papacy and the Levant (1204–1571)* (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1976); Norman Housley, *The Later Crusades, 1274–1580: From Lyons to Alcazar* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992); Tyerman, *God's War: A New History of the Crusades* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2006), chap. 25.
15. I paraphrase here the list Otto Gerhard Oexle gives in his "Utopisches Denken im Mittelalter: Pierre Dubois," *Historische Zeitschrift* 224 (1977): 324. See also the introduction to Paviot, *Projets de croisade*. An early study of these theorists, often called "publicists" (Publizisten) by German scholars, is Richard

- Scholz, *Die Publizistik zur Zeit Philipps des Schönen und Bonifaz' VIII* (Stuttgart: F. Enke, 1903).
16. On Lull's important role in late medieval France, see J. N. Hillgarth, *Ramon Lull and Lullism in Fourteenth-Century France* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971). Lull's ideas included the reconquest of the Muslim-dominated parts of Spain.
17. For exceptions, see Leopold, *How to Recover the Holy Land*, chap. 6 ("Planning for a New Jerusalem").
18. See Christine Dernbecher, "*Deum et virum suum diligens*": *Zur Rolle und Bedeutung der Frau im Umfeld der Kreuzzüge* (St. Ingbert: Röhrig Universitätsverlag, 2003); Sabine Geldsetzer, *Frauen auf Kreuzzügen 1096–1291* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2003). Both studies contain enormous bibliographies of primary and secondary works. See also Natasha R. Hodgson, *Women, Crusading and the Holy Land in Historical Narrative* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2007); the essays in *Gendering the Crusades*, ed. Susan B. Edgington and Sarah Lambert (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2001); and Myra Miranda Bom, *Women in the Military Orders of the Crusades* (New York: Palgrave, 2012).
19. For these points, see Tomas Tomasek and Helmut G. Walther, "*Gens consilio et scientia caret ita, ut non eos rationabiles extimem*: Überlegenheitsgefühl als Grundlage politischer Konzepte und literarischer Strategien der Abendländer bei der Auseinandersetzung mit der Welt des Orients," in *Die Begegnung des Westens mit dem Osten*, ed. Odilo Engels and Peter Schreiner (Stuttgart: Jan Thorbecke Verlag 1993), 253.
20. Agostino Paravicini Bagliani, *Boniface VIII: Un pape hérétique?* (Paris: Payot, 2003), 312. For an annotated list of all of Dubois's writings and their editions, see Dubois, *Recovery of the Holy Land*, 211–16.
21. Dubois, *Recovery of the Holy Land*, 4.
22. See Chris Jones, "Rex Franciae in regno suo princeps est: The Perspective of Pierre Dubois," *Comitatus* 34 (2003): 49–87; for Dubois's place in late medieval thought on the empire, see Jones, *The Eclipse of Empire?: Perceptions of the Western Empire and Its Rulers in Late-Medieval France* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007). Dubois, of course, wrote his treatise before the beginning of the Hundred Years' War (1337–1453) and the Great Schism of the Western Church (1378–1417). In the midst of these two crises calls for a crusade were often linked to the idea that internal European peace as well as an end to the Schism could be achieved through the concerted project of a crusade. Catherine of Siena (1347–80) and Philippe de Mézières were two of the most forceful advocates of this idea.
23. See Lotte Kéry, "Pierre Dubois und der Völkerbund: Ein 'Weltfriedensplan' um 1300," *Historische Zeitschrift* 283 (2006): 1–30.
24. See Palmer A. Throop, *Criticism of the Crusade: A Study of Public Opinion and Crusade Propaganda* (Amsterdam: N.V. Swets and Zeitlinger, 1940), and Elizabeth Siberry, *Criticism of Crusading 1095–1274* (Oxford:

Clarendon Press, 1985). Many poems by the French poet Rutebeuf (d. ca. 1285) address the conflicts between those favoring another crusade and those who believe that the king should stay home; see, for example, "Le débat du croisé et du décroisé," in Rutebeuf, *Oeuvres complètes*, ed. Michel Zink (Paris: 1989–90), 2:897–917.

25. This objective leads Michael R. Evans to conclude that Dubois's ideas on conversion "should be viewed primarily in a Greek rather than Muslim context"; see Evans, "Marriage as a Means of Conversion in Pierre Dubois's *De recuperatione Terre Sancte*," in *Christianizing Peoples and Converting Individuals*, ed. Guyda Armstrong and Ian N. Wood, *International Medieval Research 7* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000) 197. Yet Dubois explicitly states that young European women "may be given as wives to Saracen chiefs"; Dubois, *Recovery of the Holy Land*, 124.

26. See Renan, "Pierre Du Bois, légiste," and Langlois's introduction to Dubois, *De recuperatione Terre Sancte*.

27. Bede Jarrett, OP, *Social Theories of the Middle Ages* (London: Cass, 1926), 93; Walther I. Brandt, "Pierre Dubois: Modern or Medieval?" *American Historical Review* 35 (1929–30): 521 (my emphasis for the Brandt quote).

28. Oexle, "Utopisches Denken." For background and context, see Ernst Zeck, *Der Publizist Pierre Dubois und seine Bedeutung im Rahmen der Politik Philipps IV. des Schönen und seine literarische Denk- und Arbeitsweise im Traktat "De recuperatione Terre Sancte"* (Berlin: Weidmann, 1911); Scholz, *Publizistik*, 375–443; and Brandt, "Pierre Dubois."

29. See Robert Bartlett, *The Making of Europe: Conquest, Colonization and Cultural Change 950–1350* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993), for different medieval conceptions of colonization.

30. Sally McKee, *Uncommon Dominion: Venetian Crete and the Myth of Ethnic Purity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000), 8.

31. Prawer, *Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem*; idem, "Colonization Activities in the Latin Kingdom," in *The Medieval Frontiers of Latin Christendom: Expansion, Contraction, Continuity*, ed. James Muldoon and Felipe Fernández-Armesto (1951; repr. Farnham and Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2008), chap. 6. For a critique of Prawer, see esp. Ellenblum, *Crusader Castles*, chaps. 4–6. The introduction in MacEvitt, *Crusades*, gives an excellent overview of the different models of medieval colonialism, linking the ideas of different generations of historians to the ideological currents of their own time periods. See also the useful roundtable discussion (led by Giles Constable) of the term "colony" and its nature, in "The Crusading Kingdom of Jerusalem—The First European Colonial Society? A Symposium," in *The Horns of Hattin: Proceedings of the Second Conference of the Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East*, Jerusalem and Haifa, 2–6 July 1987, ed. Benjamin Z. Kedar (London: Variorum, 1992), 341–66. For a wide-ranging study, see Michel Balard, *Les Latins en Orient (XIe–XVe siècle)* (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 2006). Tyerman disentangles these

conflicting views in chap. 6 of *The Debate on the Crusades, 1099–2010* (Manchester, UK, Manchester University Press, 2011).

32. See Catherine Holmes, "'Shared Worlds': Religious Identities—A Question of Evidence," in *Byzantines, Latins, and Turks*, 31–59.

33. MacEvitt, *Crusades*, 14; see also Marie-Luise Favreau-Lilie, "'Multikulturelle Gesellschaft' oder 'Persecuting Society'? 'Franken' und 'Einheimische' im Königreich Jerusalem," in *Jerusalem im Hoch- und Spätmittelalter*, ed. Dieter Bauer and Klaus Herbers (Frankfurt: Campus Verlag, 2001), 55–93, and the collection *Kreuzfahrerstaaten als multikulturelle Gesellschaft*, ed. Hans Eberhard Mayer (Munich: Oldenbourg Wissenschaftsverlag, 1997).

34. Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), 7.

35. Dubois does not consider the problem of an Orthodox priest's conversion to the Latin faith—which would require either his celibacy or his abandoning the priesthood; see Evans, "Marriage as a Means of Conversion." On early interdictions of interfaith marriage, see James A. Brundage, "Marriage Law in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem," in *Outremer: Studies in the History of the Crusading Kingdom of Jerusalem Presented to Joshua Prawer*, ed. Benjamin Z. Kedar, Hans Eberhard Mayer, and Raymond Charles Smail (Jerusalem: Yad Izhak Ben-Zvi, 1982), 258–71; reprinted as chap. 17 in Brundage, *The Crusades, Holy War and Canon Law* (Aldershot: Routledge, 1991); see also Ruth Mazo Karras, *Unmarriages: Women, Men, and Sexual Unions in the Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), 112–14.

36. See Steven A. Epstein, *Purity Lost: Transgressing Boundaries in the Eastern Mediterranean 1100–1400* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007), 41. Actual marriage projects between Muslims and Christians were rare. For an example of a thwarted union described by Usamah ibn Munqidh, *The Book of Contemplation: Islam and the Crusades*, trans. Paul M. Cobb (London: Penguin, 2008), 143, and for the marriage project between Joan of Sicily, Richard the Lionheart's sister, and al-Adil, see D. S. Richards, trans., *The Rare and Excellent History of Saladin* (Aldershot: Routledge, 2001), 185–88. I thank Kiril Petkov for these references.

37. Robert I. Burns, SJ, "Christian-Islamic Confrontation in the West: The Thirteenth-Century Dream of Conversion," *American Historical Review* 76 (1971): 1395.

38. Historians are often suspicious of literary depictions of women, which frequently remain in the realm of fantasy. Yet, as Ursula Liebertz-Grün, a historian of women's education, points out, romances offered a variety of possible imagined roles to women (and to men) that enlarged the sense of what might be possible one day; see Liebertz-Grün, "Rollenbilder und weibliche Sozialisation im Adel," in *Geschichte der Mädchen- und Frauenbildung*, ed. Elke Kleinau and Claudia Opitz (Frankfurt: Campus Verlag, 1996), 1:42–62.

39. See Laurent Theis, *Dagobert: Un roi pour un peuple* (Paris: Fayard, 1982),

who sees *légistes* (that is, men like Dubois) as well as *universitaires, négociants* and *grands aristocrats* as the target audience of the immense and fantastic late medieval epics, most of them involving encounters with Saracens (50).

40. Renan underlines Dubois's links to contemporary literature, especially epics, to which, Renan believes, "il attribue une pleine valeur historique"; Renan, "Pierre Du Bois," 473.

41. Kedar, "Multidirectional Conversion in the Frankish Levant," in *Varieties of Religious Conversion in the Middle Ages*, ed. James Muldoon (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1997), 194.

42. See Sharon Kinoshita, *Medieval Boundaries: Rethinking Difference in Old French Literature* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006), 48.

43. See Patricia E. Grieve, "Floire and Blancheflor" and the European Romance (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), and Kinoshita, *Medieval Boundaries*, chap. 3.

44. See Armelle Leclercq, *Portraits croisés: L'image des Francs et des Musulmans dans les textes sur la Première Croisade; Chroniques latines et arabes, chansons de geste françaises des XIIe et XIIIe siècles* (Paris: Champion, 2010), 506.

45. On this conflict and the many different positions religious and secular writers and leaders took, see Benjamin Z. Kedar, *Crusade and Mission: European Approaches Toward the Muslims* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984), and James Muldoon, *Popes, Lawyers and Infidels: The Church and the Non-Christian World, 1250-1550* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979).

46. Catherine M. Jones, "Les chansons de geste et l'Orient," in *L'épopée romane: Actes du XV^e congrès international Rencesvals, Poitiers 21-27 août 2000*, ed. Gabriel Bianciotto (Poitiers: Université de Poitiers, Centre d'Études Supérieures de Civilisation Médiévale, 2003), 2:644; see also John V. Tolan, *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002); Suzanne Conklin Akbari, *Idols in the East: European Representations of Islam and the Orient, 1100-1450* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2009); and Leclercq, *Portraits croisés*, 13-29.

47. See Akbari, *Idols*, and Steven Kruger, "Conversion and Medieval Sexual, Religious, and Racial Categories," in *Constructing Medieval Sexuality*, ed. Karma Lochrie, Peggy McCracken, and James A. Schultz (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997), 163-65.

48. See Marie-Thérèse D'Alverny, "La connaissance de l'Islam au temps de Saint Louis," in *Septième centenaire de la mort de Saint Louis: Actes des colloques de Royaumont et de Paris* (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1976), 235-46.

49. Yvette Guilcher-Pellat, "Joinville en paennime, l'autre, l'ailleurs," in *Jean de Joinville: De la Champagne aux royaumes d'outremer*, ed. Danielle Quéruel (Langres: D. Guéniot, 1998), 193-206; Shirin Khanmohamadi, "'Casting a Sideways Glance at the Crusades': The Voice of the Other in Joinville's *Vie de Saint Louis*," *Exemplaria* 22, no. 3 (2010): 177-99.

50. See Kinoshita, *Medieval Boundaries*, chap. 1; Tolan, "Le baptême du roi

'païen' dans les épopées de la croisade," *Revue de l'Histoire des Religions* 217 (2000): 707-31; and Leclercq, *Portraits croisés*.

51. The first page number again refers to the Brandt translation, the second to the Diotti edition.

52. Praver, "Crusader Cities," in *The Medieval City*, ed. Harry A. Miskimin, David Herlihy, and A. L. Udovitch (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1977), 183.

53. The crusaders' treatment of indigenous Eastern Christians is a question I cannot address here; see MacEvitt, *Crusades*.

54. Already Renan pointed to this parallel, perhaps because Paulin Paris's essay on this epic appeared in the same volume of the *Histoire Littéraire de la France* as Renan's piece on Dubois; see Paris, "Florent et Octavien," *Histoire Littéraire de la France* 26 (1873): 303-35. I translated and paraphrased the quote from Noëlle Laborderie, ed., *Florent et Octavien: Chanson de geste du XIV^e siècle*, 2 vols. (Geneva: Slatkine, 1991), lines 3651-62.

55. For example, by David Herlihy, who calls Dubois's scheme ingenious," and Kedar, who calls Dubois's proposal "eccentric"; see Herlihy, *Opera muliebria: Women and Work in Medieval Europe* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1990), 107-10, and Kedar, *Crusade and Mission*, 201.

56. See Hillgarth, *Ramon Lull and Lullism*, chap. 2, and Kedar, *Crusade and Mission*, 189-99: "The many opinions of Ramon Lull."

57. While conversion was a popular theme, as we saw earlier, the theme of adoption was not as common. In some epics the question of adoption comes up, but it is always boys who are kidnapped by Saracens, brought up as Muslims, and then sometimes reunited with their real parents. These texts often explore complicated issues of nature and nurture; see Kinoshita, "Fraternalizing with the Enemy: Christian-Saracen Relations in *Raoul de Cambrai*," *L'Épopée romane*, 695-703, and Denis Collomp, "L'Enfant chrétien élevé chez les Sarrasins," *L'Épopée romane*, 655-72.

58. Jacques Verger, "Ad studium augmentandum: L'Utopie éducative de Pierre Dubois dans son *De recuperatione Terre Sancte* (v. 1306)," *Mélanges de la Bibliothèque de la Sorbonne* 8 (1988): 106-22; Brandt, "Pierre Dubois"; and Oexle, "Utopisches Denken."

59. Rita Copeland, "Childhood, Pedagogy, and the Literal Sense: From Late Antiquity to the Lollard Heretical Class Room," *New Medieval Literatures* 1 (1997): 147 and 140.

60. See Frank Rexroth, "Pierre Dubois und das Projekt einer universalen Heiligenlandstiftung," in *Gestiftete Zukunft im mittelalterlichen Europa, Festschrift für Michael Borgolte*, ed. Wolfgang Huschner and Frank Rexroth (Berlin: Akademie, 2008), 309-31.

61. See Charles Jourdain, "Mémoire sur l'éducation des femmes au moyen âge," *Mémoires de l'Institut National de France: Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 28 (1874): 79-133, and Nicholas Orme, *Medieval Schools: From*

Roman Britain to Renaissance England (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2006). Generally on women's education in the Middle Ages, see *Geschichte der Mädchen- und Frauenbildung*, vol. 1.

62. See Bea Lundt, "Zur Entstehung der Universität als Männerwelt," chap. 6, in *Geschichte der Mädchen- und Frauenbildung*, and Ruth Mazo Karras, *From Boys to Men: Formations of Masculinity in Late Medieval Europe* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), 67.

63. David F. Noble, *A World without Women: The Christian Clerical Culture of Western Science* (New York: Knopf, 1992), xv.

64. For a good summary of Dubois's ideas on education, see Verger, "Ad studium augmentandum."

65. Dubois's insistence on taking property away from the church has to be seen as part of his reformist ideas on bringing the church back to its original ideals of evangelical poverty. For the context of this reform thinking, see the introduction to Brandt's translation (Dubois, *Recovery of the Holy Land*, 54–55).

66. See Danielle Jacquart, *Le milieu médical en France du XIIe au XVe siècle* (Geneva: Droz, 1981), 51. For women's varied roles in medieval medicine, see also Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski, *Not of Woman Born: Representations of Caesarean Birth in Medieval and Renaissance Europe* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1990), chap. 3, and Monica H. Green, "Documenting Medieval Women's Medical Practice," *Studies in Medieval and Renaissance History* 3, no. 2 (2005): 1–46.

67. Every now and then we catch a glimpse of an individual woman doctor, such as Hersende, who cared for Louis IX during his first crusade. In the document of 1250 she is referred to as *magistra*, a title that leads Jacques Le Goff to speculate that perhaps she was university trained, although, as indicated previously, there is no evidence of women attending French universities; see Le Goff, *Saint Louis* (Paris: Gallimard, 1996), 863. Geldsetzer enumerates a number of possibilities for Hersende's functions and supplies an annotated list of documentary evidence on Hersende; Geldsetzer, *Frauen auf Kreuzzügen*, 137–40 and 193–94.

68. The latter argument stems from the twelfth-century visionary Hildegard of Bingen but is not unique to her; see Joan Cadden, *Meanings of Sex Difference in the Middle Ages: Medicine, Science, Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 75.

69. Roberta Krueger, *Women Readers and the Ideology of Gender in Old French Verse Romance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 117.

70. Dubois does not reproduce here the "informal hierarchy" that had been established by the late thirteenth or early fourteenth century and that is described by Nancy G. Siraisi: "University graduates in medicine occupied the highest place, followed by other skilled medical practitioners, then by skilled surgeons, and finally by barber surgeons and various other practitioners, among them herbalists or apothecaries"; Nancy G. Siraisi, *Medieval and Early Renaissance Medicine: An*

Introduction to Knowledge and Practice (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), 20.

71. Danielle Jacquart, "La pratique dans les oeuvres médicales à la fin du moyen âge," in *Colloque international d'histoire de la médecine médiévale* (Orléans: Société orléanaise d'histoire de la médecine, Centre Jeanne d'Arc, 1985), 1:60.

72. See Monica H. Green, "Conversing with the Minority: Relations among Christian, Jewish, and Muslim Women in the High Middle Ages," *Journal of Medieval History* 34, no. 2 (2008): 111. (This piece is the introduction to a volume of *JHM* of the same title.)

73. Possible conversion was part of this interaction. Thus an early thirteenth-century Muslim traveler reported that in Palermo "Muslim maidservants were persuading Christian women to convert"; Green, "Conversing," 114–15. Around the same time (1230) the German poet Der Stricker composed *The Queen of the Moors*, where he imagined that a "heathen queen sends out hundreds of beautiful black women as erotic secret agents into the realm of a Christian queen to lure [Christian knights] into pagan superstition and idolatry" by seducing them; see Valentin Groebner, "The Carnal Knowing of a Coloured Body: Sleeping with Arabs and Blacks in the European Imagination, 1300–1550," in *The Origins of Racism in the Medieval West*, 219. Juxtaposing documentary and literary sources gives us a more complete impression of the medieval *imaginaire*.

74. See *The Trotula: A Medieval Compendium of Women's Medicine*, ed. and trans. Monica H. Green (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001).

75. My remarks here are based mostly on Berthold Altaner, "Raymundus Lullus und der Sprachkanon (can. 11) des Konzils von Vienne (1312)," *Historisches Jahrbuch* 53 (1933): 190–219, and Hillgarth, *Ramon Lull and Lullism*.

76. Dubois, *Recovery of the Holy Land*, 114n11.

77. Altaner, "Raymundus Lullus," 214–15.

78. This equality is also posited later by Christine de Pizan in her *Book of the City of Ladies* (1405): "If it were the custom to send little girls to school and have them study the sciences, as one does in the case of boys, they would learn just as perfectly and would understand the subtleties of the arts and sciences as boys do. And as it happens there are such women: for, as I touched on earlier, just as women have more delicate bodies than men, weaker and less able to do various things, so they have minds that are more open and sharper in the cases where they apply themselves"; Pizan, *The Selected Writings of Christine de Pizan: A Norton Critical Edition*, ed. Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski (New York: Norton: 1997), 136. Already in 1911 Emilie Schomann had pointed to a possible relation between Dubois and Christine de Pizan in her *Französische Utopisten und ihr Frauenideal* (Berlin: E. Felber, 1911); 229nn5 and 10, a topic I cannot explore here but have done so in a paper presented at the Christine de Pizan conference in Louvain-la-Neuve (July 2015).

79. This brief coda wants to do nothing more than raise some questions

pertinent to women and medieval colonialism that I plan to address in more detail in a future study.

80. The first treatise in Latin, entitled *Nova religio milicie Passionis Jhesu Christi pro acquisitione civitatis Jherusalem et Terre Sancte*, exists in two different versions from 1367–68 and 1384 and is preserved in Bibliothèque Mazarine manuscript 1943, part 2. It remains unedited. The second treatise in French (1389–94), *La sustance de la chevalerie de la Passion de Jhesu Crist*, was edited by A. H. Hamdy, in part 3 of his “Philippe de Mézières and the New Order of the Passion,” *Bulletin of the Faculty of Arts, Alexandria, Egypt* 18 (1964): 1–105, from manuscript Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Ashmole 813. The third version (in French) from 1396 is in manuscript Bibliothèque de l’Arsenal 2251 and was edited by Muriel Joyce Brown as a dissertation at the University of Nebraska in 1971.

81. Together with Pierre de Thomas and Peter of Lusignan, Philippe criss-crossed Europe in search of financial and ideological support for a crusade. Philippe’s first work (1366) was devoted to his friend, the saintly Pierre de Thomas; see Philippe de Mézières, *Life of Saint Peter Thomas*, ed. Joachim Smet (Rome: Institutum Carmelitanum, 1954). On the place of this *vita* in late medieval crusade ideology, see Blumenfeld-Kosinski, “Philippe de Mézières’s *Life of Saint Pierre de Thomas* at the Crossroads of Late Medieval Hagiography and Crusading Ideology,” *Viator* 40 (2009): 223–48.

82. Philippe Contamine calls de Mézières’s project a “colonie permanente”; see Contamine, “Guerre et paix à la fin du moyen âge: L’action et la pensée de Philippe de Mézières (vers 1327–1405),” in *Pages d’histoire militaire médiévale (XIVe–XVe siècles)* (Paris: de Boccard, 2005), 288. For details on the new state’s organization, see Nicolae Iorga, *Philippe de Mézières et la croisade au XIVe siècle* (Paris: 1896), esp. 349–52, 454–59, and 489–97.

83. De Mézières, *Songe du vieux pèlerin*, trans. Joël Blanchard (Paris: Pocket, 2008), 916–17, and idem, *Songe du viel pèlerin*, 2 vols., ed. Joël Blanchard with Antoine Calvet and Didier Kahn (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 2015), 2:1279. Philippe’s plans for a crusade involved huge numbers. When thinking about the Baltic Sea’s 300,000 herring fishermen, he mused that if they directed their boats south they could turn themselves into a mighty navy that, together with about 150,000 knights and soldiers, could reconquer the Holy Land; *Songe*, trans. Blanchard, 192; *Songe*, ed. Blanchard, 1:229.

84. Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge*, 33.

85. Hamdy, “Philippe de Mézières,” 81. See also Stahuljak, *Pornographic Archeology*, 87: The nineteenth-century historian Jules Michelet believed that during the crusades the “uprooting from the cultural milieu of origin led to a ‘loosening of mores.’”

86. See Contamine, “Guerre et paix,” for the composition of this order. For its members, see Adrian Bell, “English Members of the Order of the Passion: Their Political, Diplomatic and Military Significance,” in *Philippe de Mézières and His*

Age: Piety and Politics in the Fourteenth Century, ed. Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski and Kiril Petkov, *Medieval Mediterranean* 91, *Peoples, Economies, Culture, 400–1500* (Leiden and Boston, Brill, 2012), 321–46, and Contamine, “Les princes, barons et chevaliers qui a la chevalerie au service de Dieu se sont ja vouez’: Recherches prosopographiques sur l’ordre de la Passion de Jésus-Christ (1385–1395),” in *La noblesse et la croisade à la fin du moyen âge (France, Bourgogne, Bohême)*, ed. Martin Nejedly and Jaroslav Svátek, Collection “Médiennes” 2, Série Croisades Tardives (Toulouse: Presses universitaires du Midi, 2009), 43–67. Despite promises of participation, the order never materialized.

87. Philippe Contamine and Joan B. Williamson describe these fashion ideas in great detail; see Contamine, “La place des femmes dans les deux premières règles (1367–68 et 1384) de l’ordre de la chevalerie de la Passion de Jésus-Christ de Philippe de Mézières,” in *Au cloître et dans le monde: Femmes, hommes et société (IXe–XVe siècles): Mélanges en l’honneur de Paulette L’Hermite-Leclercq*, ed. Patrick Henriot and Anne-Marie Legras (Paris: Presses universitaires de l’université de Paris-Sorbonne, 2000), 81–88, and Williamson, “The ‘Chevalerie de la Passion Jhesu Crist’: Philippe de Mézières’ Utopia,” in *Gesellschaftsutopien im Mittelalter: Discours et figures de l’utopie au moyen âge*, ed. Danielle Buschinger and Wolfgang Spiewok (Greifswald: Reineke-Verlag, 1994), 165–73. Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Ashmole 813, has illustrations of Philippe’s designs.

88. Iorga suggests that Philippe was inspired by the early church here, where property was not forbidden but held in common; Iorga, *Philippe de Mézières*, 349. In the *Songe du vieux pèlerin* Philippe objects strongly to the social ascendancy of the financiers, who through their wealth may claim to be superior to a duke; de Mézières, *Songe*, trans. Blanchard, 385; *Songe*, ed. Blanchard, 1:504.

89. As Joan Williamson rightly observes, the ecclesiastical debate over women’s second marriages is jettisoned here in favor of a demographic concern for increasing the population in the new colonies; Williamson, “Chevalerie,” 171.

90. “Monseigneur, creez vous ces vieulx chevaliers qui parlent le sarrasin? Ilz sont moitié Sarrasins, ne les creez pas”; *Une Epistre lamentable et consolatoire adressee en 1397 à Philippe le Hardi, duc de Bourgogne, sur la défaite de Nicopolis*, ed. Philippe Contamine and Jacques Paviot (Paris: Société de l’Histoire de France, 2008), 141, and Hamdy, “Philippe de Mézières,” 97.

91. Williamson, “Chevalerie,” 170.

92. Hamdy, “Philippe de Mézières,” 93. In fact, Philippe despised the Eastern Orthodox Christians even more than the Muslims; see Petkov, “The Rotten Apple and the Good Apples: Orthodox, Catholics, and Turks in Philippe de Mézières’ Crusading Propaganda,” *Journal of Medieval History* 23 (1997): 255–70. That Christian women could marry Muslims is unthinkable for Philippe.

93. See Sander Gilman, *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985); quoted by Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge*, 46n25.